information & economics

concepts of information

April 5, 2010
who owns information?

library science
philosophy
cognitive science
computer science
economics
social sciences, sciences ....
"basic results [of information theory] are aimed in a very specific direction ... not necessarily relevant to such fields as psychology, economics, and other social sciences."

--Shannon, "Bandwagon Effect"
overview

why economics

economics & information
a historical account

economics, information, & development
why economics?

information age gurus?
why economics?

information age gurus?

Charles Hamlin
William Harding
Daniel Crissinger
Roy Young
Eugene Mayer
Eugene Black
Marriner Eccles
why economics?

information age gurus?

Charles Hamlin
William Harding
Daniel Crissinger
Roy Young
Eugene Mayer
Eugene Black
Marriner Eccles

Thomas McCabe
William McChesney Martin
Arthur Burns
G. William Miller
why economics?

information age gurus?

Charles Hamlin
William Harding
Daniel Crissinger
Roy Young
Eugene Mayer
Eugene Black
Marriner Eccles

Thomas McCabe
William McChesney Martin
Arthur Burns
G. William Miller
Paul Volker
why economics?

information age gurus?

Charles Hamlin  
William Harding  
Daniel Crissinger  
Roy Young  
Eugene Mayer  
Eugene Black  
Marriner Eccles

Thomas McCabe  
William McChesney Martin  
Arthur Burns  
G. William Miller  
Paul Volker  
Alan Greenspan*
why economics?

information age gurus?

Charles Hamlin
William Harding
Daniel Crissinger
Roy Young
Eugene Mayer
Eugene Black
Marriner Eccles

Thomas McCabe
William McChesney Martin
Arthur Burns
G. William Miller
Paul Volker
Alan Greenspan*

*“veritable rock-star economist”
why economics?

information age gurus?

Charles Hamlin  
William Harding  
Daniel Crissinger  
Roy Young  
Eugene Mayer  
Eugene Black  
Marriner Eccles  

Thomas McCabe  
William McChesney Martin  
Arthur Burns  
G. William Miller  
Paul Volker  
Alan Greenspan*  
Ben Bernanke

*“veritable rock-star economist”
economics &
the public sphere

**econopundits**

*New York Times*: Paul Krugman

*New York Times*: “the economic scene”

*New Yorker*: Malcolm Gladwell

*New Yorker*: James Surowieki

*The Wisdom of Crowds*

**econoblogging:**

Brad deLong, Tyler Cowan, Matthew Yglesias,
Marginal Revolution, Crooked Timber ...
economics & the public sphere

economic argument & contrarian glee

Steven Leavitt & Stephen Dubner,
Freakonomics, 2006

Superfreakonomics, 2009
Wresting the Economic Debate Away from the Economists

9:00 AM Wednesday March 31, 2010 | Comments (11)

David Brooks wondered in his New York Times column last week if economists shouldn't try to become more like historians. That was interesting to read, given that I had just spent time with a bunch of historians (and a few other humanities professors) who were wondering how they could become more like economists.
Wresting the Economic Debate Away from the Economists

David Brooks wondered in his New York Times column last week if economists shouldn’t try to become more like historians. That was interesting to read, given that I had just spent time with a bunch of historians (and a few other humanities professors) who were wondering how they could become more like economists.

Is economics a science?

This is a question that popped up on twitter last night and I want to address it somewhat. First, I want to say up front that there is more agreement economists then the blogosphere and popular media would suggest. Here is Tyler Cowen making the same point, and I’d venture that most of the economist bloggers, even those who disagree with the mainstream on a lot, would agree with that.
"Economics has come nearer than any other social science to an answer to that central question of all social sciences, how the combination of fragments of knowledge existing in different minds can bring about results which, if they were to be brought about deliberately, would require a knowledge on the part of the directing mind which no single person can possess."

Hayek, “Economics and Knowledge,” 1937
"Economics is far more versatile than its critics believe. It is a method of analysis and not just a field of study. The method is to combine two core assumptions—individual optimization and equilibrium—with various sets of specific assumptions adapted to different fields of application. The method is applicable not only to the market system but also the social and political environment within which this system is embedded. Social and psychological insights can be encapsulated in the specification of interdependent preferences, which hold the key to modelling all kinds of institutional behavior in rational terms."

Buckley & Casson. "Economics as an imperialist social science" 1993
neither irony nor shame?

"Economics is not only a social science, it is a genuine science ... refutable implications. ...By almost any market test, economics is the premier social science. The field attracts the most students, enjoys the attention of policy-makers and journalists, and gains notice, both positive and negative, from other scientists. In large part, the success of economics derives from its rigor and relevance as well as from its generality. The economic toolbox can be used to address a large variety of problems drawn from a wide range of topics."

E.P. Lazear, "Economic Imperialism," 2000
lest we forget

freedom, free information & free markets

Lou Rosetto, MBA
Kevin Kelly
Chris Anderson

... Esther Dyson
George Gilder
Newt Gingrich
Alvin Toffler
Information Rules

Punk Rules OK

Carl Shapiro and Hal R. Varian
attractiveness

broad explanatory power

robust modelling

whiggish history
- Mandeville's "harlot & highwayman"
- progress: rising height, weight, gdp

pareto efficiency

predictable future

"the competitive model virtually made economics a branch of engineering" -- Stiglitz

differential efficiency

self-regulating systems
a field in step

political economy to economics
law and economics

academic consensus

conceptual consensus
markets, preferences, equilibrium & rationality

modelling consensus
"do the math"

the decline of "high-development theory"
The Wisdom of Crowds
James Surowiecki


“As entertaining and thought-provoking as The Tipping Point by Malcolm Gladwell... The Wisdom of Crowds ranges far and wide.”
—The Boston Globe
"These Late Scholastics observed the existence of economic law, inexorable forces of cause and effect that operate very much as other natural laws." http://mises.org/etexts/austrian.asp

The procession of technological discoveries is inevitable. When the conditions are right — when the necessary web of supporting technology needed for every invention is established — then the next adjacent technological step will emerge as if on cue. If inventor X does not produce it, inventor Y will. ...the paths of technologies are inevitable. They are 1) that quantifiable trajectories of progress don't waver despite attempts to shift them (see my Moore's Law).  

-- Kevin Kelly, 2009
"A belief in spontaneous progress must make us blind to the role of government in economic life. This role consists often in altering the rate of change ... if we believe that rate to be unalterable--or even worse, if we deem it a sacrilege to interfere with it--then of course no room is left for intervention."

Karl Polanyi, *The Great Transformation*, 1944
lest Surowieiki forgot

Mississippi Scheme
South-Sea Bubble
Tulipomania
... 
Dot.com boom?
... 
sub-prime mortgages
hesitations

goodhart not moore?

gresham not graham

moral hazard

herd behavior

and the Keynesian beauty contest
2008 -- end of empire?

a field in crisis?
freshwater vs saltwater

old rebels
Stiglitz, new Keynesians

new rebels
Greenspan?
Posner??

return of the repressed?
marxists
behaviorists
Samuelson
Richardson?
"The ideas of economists and political philosophers, both when they are right and when they are wrong, are more powerful than is commonly understood. Indeed the world is ruled by little else. Practical men, who believe themselves to be quite exempt from any intellectual influences, are usually the slaves of some defunct economist."

--Keynes

Zombie economics --John Quiggin, 2010
"But the notion that somehow my views on regulation were predominant and effective at influencing the Congress is something you may have perceived. But it didn’t look that way from my point of view."

Alan Greenspan, testimony, 4/7/2010

"Today’s competitive markets, whether we seek to recognise it or not, are driven by an international version of Adam Smith’s “invisible hand” that is unredeemably opaque. With notably rare exceptions (2008, for example), the global “invisible hand” has created relatively stable exchange rates, interest rates, prices, and wage rates."

Alan Greenspan, FT, 3/30/2011
with notably rare exceptions

Russian Roulette is a fun, safe game for all the family to play

Adolf Hitler was tolerant of diverse religions and cultures

Japanese nuclear reactors have been secure from earthquakes

the United States follows its treaty obligations

Newt Gingrich is a loyal and faithful husband

Germany remained at peace with its neighbors

Charles Manson has lived a peaceful life

Mrs. Lincoln enjoyed the play
overview

why economics

economics & information

a historical account

economics, information, & development
"English wool, is said indeed, during the course of the present century, to have fallen a good deal in proportion to its quality. Quality, however, is so very disputable a matter, that I look upon all information of this kind as somewhat uncertain."

"By the information which they received, they judged whether it was worth while to make a settlement there, or if the country was worth the conquering."
"the real interests of the servants is by no means the same with that of the country, and the most perfect information would not necessarily put an end to their oppressions."

--Adam Smith, *Wealth of Nations*, 1776
shanonesque or dretskean?

"the nerves which carry the information ... to the brain"
--Thomas Malthus, *Principles of Population*, 1830

"these machines have generally been established for the purpose of transmitting information during war"
--Charles Babbage, *On the Economy of Machinery and Manufactures*, 1832
"Perfectly reflex actions, such as that of breathing during sleep, are performed by the responsibility of the local nerve centres without any reference to the supreme central authority of the thinking power, which is supposed to reside in the cerebrum. But all deliberate movements require the attention of the chief central authority: it receives information from the nerve centres or local authorities and perhaps in some cases direct from the sentient nerves, and sends back detailed and complex instructions to the local authorities, or in some cases direct to the muscular nerves, and so co-ordinates their action as to bring about the required results"

"Systems in many respects resemble machines. A machine is a little system, created to perform, as well as to connect together in reality, those different movements and effects which the artist has occasion for. A system is an imaginary machine invented to connect together in fancy those different movements and effects which are in reality performed."

--Adam Smith, *Wealth of Nations*, 1776
"When I first saw the plan and superstructure of your very ingenious and very learned Treatise on the Wealth of Nations, it gave me the compleat idea of ... A System, that might fix some first principles in the most important of sciences, the knowledge of the human community and its operations. That might become *principia* to the knowledge of political economy as Mathematicks are to Mechanics, Astronomy, and the other Sciences."

--Thomas Pownall, *Letter ... to Adam Smith*, 1776
REGULATING POWER.

"That beautiful contrivance the governor of the steam-engine, must immediately occur to all who are familiar with that admirable machine. Wherever the increased speed of an engine would lead to injurious or dangerous consequences, ... In the dock-yard at Chatham, the descending motion of a large platform, on which timber is raised, is regulated by a governor; but as the weight is very considerable, the velocity of this governor is still further checked by causing its motion to take place in water."

--Charles Babbage, *Economy of Machinery ...* 1832
self-regulation

not state regulation

The Road to Serfdom, 1944

The Fatal Conceit, 1988

[cp Friedman, Capitalism & Freedom, 1962]

knowledge & information

“Economics and Knowledge,” 1937

“The Use of Knowledge in Society,” 1945
"Clearly there is here a problem of the division of knowledge which is quite analogous to, and at least as important as, the problem of the division of labour. ... instead of showing what bits of information the different persons must possess in order to bring about the result, we fall in effect back on the assumption that everybody knows everything."

Hayek, “Economics and Knowledge,” 1937
invisible hands

"... the spontaneous actions of individuals will under conditions which we can define bring about a distribution of resources ... as if it were made according to a single plan"
mechanisms again

"the price system ... a mechanism for communicating information"

"in a system where knowledge of the relevant facts is dispersed among many people, prices can act to coordinate the separate actions"

"the unavoidable imperfection of man's knowledge and the consequent need for a process by which knowledge is constantly communicated and acquired"
convergence

Shannon & Weaver to von Neumann & Morgenstern
(Theory of Games, 1944) "perfect information"

Babbage to Weiner
Cybernetics, or Control and Communication in the Animal and the Machine, 1948

Bateson

Herb Simon
AI and economic decision making
"One should hardly have to tell academicians that information is a valuable resource: knowledge is power"

information, search, uncertainty, advertising, signalling

George Stigler, “The Economics of Information,” 1961
embracing knowledge

"information as that which is being communicated becomes identical with 'knowledge' in the sense of that which is known"

--Fritz Machlup, The Production and Distribution of Knowledge, 1963
"All the aspects of knowledge--its creation, its storage, its retrieval, its treatment as property, its role in the functioning of societies and organizations--can be (and have been) analyzed with the tools of economics. Knowledge has a price and a cost of production; there are markets for knowledge, with their supply curves, and marginal rates of substitution."

--Herbert Simon,  
"The many shapes of knowledge," 1999

"Chicago School ... one simply analyzed the special factors determining the demand for and supply of information, just as one might analyze the factors affecting the market for wheat."

--Stiglitz
"As the market grows in these dimensions, there will appear a set of firms which specialize in collecting and selling information. They may take the form of trade journals or specialized brokers ... there is a strong tendency towards monopoly ... a 'standard' source for trade information".

--Stigler,

"The Economics of Information," 1961
"'knowledge' is rarely reducible to information"

by neglecting the whole problem of information, the perfect competition model condemns itself not only to unrealism but to inadequacy even as a hypothetical system"

G.B. Richardson, 
*Information & Investment*, 1960

[or "the economics of imperfect knowledge"]
"When there is uncertainty, there is usually the possibility of reducing it by the acquisition of information. Indeed, information is merely the negative measure of uncertainty. ... --Kenneth Arrow

"Information & Economic Behavior," 1973
"I will think rather of information as a general descriptive term for an economically interesting **category of goods** which has not hitherto been accorded much attention by economic theorists....information is like a commodity ... But ... only to a limited extent"

--Arrow, "Information & Economic Behavior," 1973

non-excludible; non-rivalrous differential information

adverse selection
nihilistic acts

the Denning assumption
dissent from methodological individualism "implies that the behavior of men is directed by mysterious forces that defy analysis and description."

"Many resource-based theorists reject formal modelling altogether, and adopt the nihilistic stance that in a complex world any model of the firm will distort more than it illuminates."
Mark Casson, Information and Organization, 1997
limits to organization

"Economy arises only if the signals transmitted are summaries of the information received . . . the costs of transmission are much lower than those of acquisition, and it is possible that joining the observers into a single organization can represent a net economy. ... Once learned, however, it is cheaper to reuse the same system than to learn a new one . . . If external conditions change, an originally optimal communication system may no longer be the one that would be chosen. . . . Eventually the communication system may be very inefficient at handling signals, and the firm may vanish." -- Arrow
more problems?

“There is an incentive for sellers to market poor quality merchandise ... The difficulty of distinguishing good quality from bad is inherent in the business world.

An asymmetry in available information has developed: for the sellers now have more knowledge about the quality of a car than the buyers ...Gresham’s law has made a modified reappearance."

information plugs a gap?

"I was struck by the imperfections of information ... asymmetries ... between those governing and those governed."

"peculiar implications of the model ... it seemed not to address issues such as incentives and motivation. But much of the research was directed not at these big gaps."

--Stiglitz
what do we mean by full, im/perfect, in/complete, or a/symmetrical information?

and how do we perfect, complete, or make full or symmetrical?

"it is hard to imagine what a world with perfect information would be like"

--Stiglitz
range or binary?

"While there is a single way in which information is perfect, there are an infinite number of ways in which information can be imperfect."

Stiglitz
"perfect information ... free, complete, instantaneous, and universally available ... [is] one of the defining features of the perfect market ...

"at the same time, both the perfect and the actual market structure ... depend on information being a commodity, ... costly, partial, and deliberately restricted"

--James Boyle,

Shamans, Software & Spleen, 1996
economic information?
back to the news

Habermas

news as commodity
vs
news as informing the public sphere
overview

why economics

economics & information
a historical account

economics, information, & development
moving knowledge?

knowledge management

the HP conundrum

sticky vs leaky

resolution
spatial divisions

"somewhere in the world a new opportunity for the use of some raw material, say tin, has arisen ..."--Hayek, 1945

divisions of commodities labor knowledge
The mechanical faculty of Lancashire is said to be due to the influence of Norman smiths who were settled at Warrington by Hugo de Lupus in William the Conqueror's time. And the greater part of England's manufacturing industry before the era of cotton and steam had its course directed by settlements of Flemish and other artisans; many of which were made under the immediate direction of Plantagenet and Tudor kings. These immigrants taught us how to weave woollen and worsted stuffs, .... They taught us how to cure herrings, how to manufacture silk, how to make lace, glass, and paper, and to provide for many other of our wants.

When an industry has thus chosen a locality for itself, it is likely to stay there long: so great are the advantages which people following the same skilled trade get from near neighbourhood to one another. The mysteries of the trade become no mysteries; but are as it were in the air, and children learn many of them unconsciously. Good work is rightly appreciated, inventions and improvements in machinery, in processes and the general organization of the business have their merits promptly discussed: if one man starts a new idea, it is taken up by others and combined with suggestions of their own; and thus it becomes the source of further new ideas. And presently subsidiary trades grow up in the neighbourhood, supplying it with implements and materials, organizing its traffic, and in many ways conducing to the economy of its material. -- Marshall
limits to localization?

Every cheapening of the means of communication, every new facility for the free interchange of ideas between distant places alters the action of the forces which tend to localize industries. Speaking generally we must say that a lowering of tariffs, or of freights for the transport of goods, tends to make each locality buy more largely from a distance what it requires; and thus tends to concentrate particular industries in special localities: but on the other hand everything that increases people's readiness to migrate from one place to another tends to bring skilled artisans to ply their crafts near to the consumers who will purchase their wares. --Marshall
The Great Transformation

im/mobility

commodities

finance

people?

ideas, ethics

nationally (19c)

internationally (20c)
"human capital .. could be studied using the economic tools developed for objects"

"Must economic theory recognize a different kind of good--ideas--if it is to explain .. growth?... If there are only object gaps, the implications for poor countries are much more pessimistic than if there are also idea gaps"

--Paul Romer
"Idea gaps, in contrast are relatively easy to solve. ... an important fraction of worldwide poverty may be due to an idea gap that can be reduced at relatively low cost. ... the world already possess the knowledge needed to provide a decent standard of living for everyone on Earth ... crucial pieces of specialized, highly trained human capital can be put to work domestically by inviting in managers and technicians."

--Romer
the object gap disappears?

"Access... through unimpeded flows of the capital goods that are produced in industrialized nations."

"absorption capacity ..."
disequilibrium?

economic discourse

communication theory

information/knowledge

the place of information