Quality and Material Form: Where are "books" online?

Geoff Nunberg
IS 218
Quality of Information
10/10/07
Books? Where we're going we don't need books.

A clash of fetishisms

"Nobody is going to sit down and read a novel on a twitchy little screen. Ever."
— E. Annie Proulx

“Paper is just an object that [some] information has been sprayed onto in the past...”
— Ted Nelson
Books? Where we're going we don't need books.

A clash of fetishisms

"Nobody is going to sit down and read a novel on a twitchy little screen. Ever." — E. Annie Proulx

“Paper is just an object that [some] information has been sprayed onto in the past...” — Ted Nelson

--> What do you want to be playing with in your lap when you go to bed at night?
“Twitchy little screens” and the future of the book

2000 Microsoft Reader debuts

2009 E-books begin to outsell paper

2016 Last print newspaper

2019 Paper books remain popular among collectors...

2020 Dictionary definition of book changes
Debates over the book

Much of the discussion seems to be about whether, and if so when, e-books will replace traditional print-on-paper books, and a great deal of the debate is infused with sentimental appeals to reading on the beach or in the bath, the joys of finely printed books, and of browsing in good bookstores.

Cliff Lynch
books...
. . . and my books
The perils of supercession:
"Ceci tuera cela"

The archdeacon silently considered the giant edifice, then with a sigh extended his right hand toward the book that was open on the table and his left hand toward Notre-Dame, casting a sad look from the book to the church. "Alas," he said, "This will kill that."
Complicating the story

Ceci doen't often kill cela -- more like nudges it aside a bit...

The sentimentally framed questions about digital books and electronic devices replacing printed books are largely irrelevant, an artificial and distracting controversy. Both can and undoubtedly will co-exist for a long time to come and will find their appropriate audiences and market niches. CL
The real issues are more fundamental: how do we think of books in the digital world, and how will books behave? How will we be able to use them, to share them, and to refer to them? In particular, what are our expectations about the persistence and permanence of human communication as embodied in books as we enter the brave new digital world? Will our thinking be dominated by the conventions and business models of print publishing (and the current power relationships among publishers, readers, and authors), and by our cultural practices, consumer expectations, legal frameworks and social norms related to books, or will we discard these traditions...? CL
What is a book?

Primary and Secondary Representations
Further Complications: What is "essentially" a book?

Certain specific genres have been a great success in electronic forms, and these are rapidly displacing printed products. For example, bibliographies, abstracting and indexing guides, citation indexes, dictionaries, encyclopedias, directories, product catalogs, and maintenance manuals for complex systems such as aircraft work well in digital form. In a sense, by moving to the digital medium we have been able to understand these kinds of works more deeply, and to bring out their essence.

CL
Further Complications: What is "essentially" a book?

We can also learn from what has happened as scholarly journals, newspapers, and magazines have moved to electronic form. These shifts have been relatively successful in that the electronic versions have found substantial readership, but they aren’t yet displacing the print products. The "unit" of reading in such works ranges from a page or so (a newspaper column) to a few dozen pages (for a typical journal article). Basically, the printed form has been translated rather literally into an electronic representation for these kinds of content. Numerous studies in university settings [6] have discovered what people do with these electronic offerings: They use the online (or other computer-based version) to browse, to do quick checking, to decide what they do and do not want to read carefully. But if the piece is over a few screens in length, they print the article for reading. In essence, they are using paper - a mature, robust, and exquisitely effective viewing technology - as their preferred user interface for reading.
Where does "bookness" inhere?

**content and form**

**book**, AHD: 1. A set of written, printed, or blank pages fastened along one side and encased between protective covers. 2a. A printed or written literary work.
Where does "bookness" inhere?

Other distinctions: mode of diffusion, circulation, reproduction, etc.
E.g., distribute-&-print vs. print-&-distribute
Why do some genres "resist" digitization?

The reading experience? Books and the body

"My readers... will see in the tell-tale compression of the pages before them, that we are all hastening together to perfect felicity."

Jane Austen, in the final chapter of *Northanger Abbey*
Reading Jane Austen Online: Like touring Hampshire through a bombsight

Chapter 1

Sir Walter Elliot, of Kellynch Hall, in Somersetshire, was a man who, for his own amusement, never took up any book but the Baronetage. There he found occupation for an idle hour, and consolation in a distressed one; there his faculties were roused into admiration and respect, by contemplating the limited remnant of the earliest patents, there any unrolled some sensations, arising from domestic affairs changed naturally into pity and contempt as he turned over the almost endless creations of the last century; and there, if every other leaf were powerless, he could read his own history with an interest which never failed. This was the page at which the favourite volume always opened:

*ELLIOOT OF KELLYNCH HALL*

"Walter Elliot, born March 1, 1760, married, July 15, 1784, Elizabeth, daughter of James Stevenson, Esq. of South Park, in the county of Gloucester, by which lady (who died 1800) he has issue Elizabeth, born June 1, 1785; Anne, born August 9, 1787, a still-born son, November 5, 1789; Mary, born November 20, 1791."

Precisely such had the paragraph originally stood from the printer’s hands, but Sir Walter had improved it by adding, for the information of himself and his family, these words, after the date of Mary’s birth:—

"Married December 16, 1810, Charles, surnamed, heir of Charles..."
Some Cases in Point:
1. Journal vs Monograph
A Puzzle about University Press Publishing

Top 1% of sites

Concentration of Web Traffic

Source: Alexa Research

Based on Alexa users in July '99
Power law distribution of users among sites

number of users

number of sites
Where the action is:
The middle range of the powerlaw curve
Where the Web Has the Biggest Effect
The Biggest Gains for the Middle Range

North of Wilshire

English
Steven Spielberg
Madonna
First-run trade publishers

South of Wilshire

Hungarian
Erich Rohmer
Carlos Varela
Book resellers
Small presses...

But not the scholarly monograph...
The Crisis of University Publishing

The endangered monograph

“University Printing Presses exist ... for the purpose of producing books that no-one can read.” *Microcosmographia Academica*, 1908

Print runs decline from 3000 in 1960's to <700 by 2000.
Journals Have Less Serious Problems than Monographs

Journals
Can be read online or printed by individual readers
Authors skilled at editorial preparation
Production uses templates
Predictable print runs
Appeal to general disciplinary community
One-time purchase decisions
  Lower marketing costs per sale
  Each annual renewal adds value
Increased costs can be passed along to libraries
But monographs haven't benefitted...

Monographs

- Authors require more editorial help
- Production process is usually unique for each title (in US)
- Unpredictable print runs -- overruns & underruns common
- Each title appeals to a unique audience
- Separate purchase decisions for each title
  - Increases marketing costs per sale
  - Reprintings do not add value
- Squeezed by diminishing library budgets for monograph purchases, availability of titles from online resellers
But monographs haven't benefitted...

Monographs
Difficult to read online,
awkward to print by individual readers
"The calculus is stark: find more money, reduce the demand to publish monographs, or greatly reduce the cost per monograph somehow."

"The Specialized Scholarly Monograph in Crisis," Clifford Lynch, Director, Coalition for Networked Initiatives
"Find More Money"

Proposals to add publishing subventions to faculty compensations

- But seems to turn university presses into vanity presses
- Concentrate on "hot" topics or expand UP offerings into midlist trade publishing & fiction

Indiana U.  
U. Of Kentucky  
U. of Florida
"Find More Money"

Absorb university press into library
  e.g., Rice, Georgetown, Tennessee
Libraries have bigger budgets, more extensive infrastructure and specialized staff. Easier for libraries to get grants & subventions.
  UP backlist becomes part of library's digitization program.
Libraries will assume key role in building computational infrastructure for the social sciences and humanities. UP's may play a role as well.
Lowering the costs of monograph publishing

Consolidating sales, marketing, distribution (but not of editorial process)
Redesigning and automating workflow & order processing
Doing less editing
Marketing online

All of these have been attempted, sometimes with modest effects on publication costs
Lowering Costs of Production & Distribution

Print-on-demand reduces overstock, inventory costs; preserves "thud factor"


Print-on-demand at libraries, copy centers, etc.

Driven by increasing availability of digitized archival materials (e.g., ACLS history e-book project, Google print, Internet Archive)
ACLS History E-Book Project

Collaboration of American Council of Learned Societies, 75 participating publishers, U. of Michigan

Publishes 250 previous published titles in history annually, as selected by advisory board, along with reviews, etc.

Publishes new titles in XML format, with links to supporting materials, source materials, etc.

Texts are OCR'd, permit searching.

Texts available to subscribing libraries for onscreen viewing or print-on-demand. Royalties paid to authors according to downloads or page views.

Soon to be extended to religion, art history, musicology, etc.
Aggregating Distribution

For monographs, print-on-demand can only reduce costs moderately, but permits aggregation of monographs into series.
Aggregating Monograph Distribution

1200 texts, searchable, with linked footnotes etc. Available by subscription.
University Scholarship Repositories
University Scholarship Repositories
Market pressures drive some authors to produce more general-interest books. Professional organizations (e.g., the Modern Language Association) are urging tenure committees to place more weight on journal articles, and even Web publications.
"The crisis of the specialized scholarly monograph is in reality the crisis of the academic profession."
Steven Humphries

New electronic formats offer alternative genres of publication, from Web publications to blogs to discussion groups -- if credentialing bodies will accept them.

Editing tasks devolve on authors etc.

New roles for open source?
THE DICKENS PROJECT

The Dickens Project of the University of California is a scholarly consortium devoted to promoting the study and enjoyment of the life, times, and work of Charles Dickens. LEARN MORE ->

2007 High School Essay Contest

THE DICKENS UNIVERSE

The Dickens Universe is a week-long summer gathering that brings together scholars, school teachers, and members of the general public for a week of study and Dickensian conviviality. The book for the 2007 Dickens Universe will be The Pickwick Papers. Dates will be Sunday July 29 to Saturday August 4.

2007 NEH SUMMER SEMINAR

This year's NEH Summer Seminar, Adaptation and Revision: The Example of Great Expectations, focuses on Dickens's immortal novel and how it has been reinterpreted since its publication.

FACTS ABOUT DICKENS

Did you know that, contrary to popular myth, Charles Dickens was not paid by the word? You can learn more about Dickens and his work at our DICKENS CHRONOLOGY.

OUR MUTUAL FRIEND

Co-sponsored by The Dickens Project and the BBC, "Our Mutual Friend: The Scholarly Pages," is an electronic archive dedicated to providing information on Dickens's last-completed novel. READ MORE.
New Forms of Historical Scholarship

Brain Surgery Live
Wednesday, October 25, 2006

This is a gripping one hour webcast from earlier today in which neurosurgeons at Children's Hospital Boston remove a brain tumor employing functional mapping of the cortex on a 13-year-old boy.

FILED IN SEMANTICS NEWS | COMMENTS (0) | PERMALINK

GURT 2007: Little Words
Friday, October 20, 2006

The Georgetown University Round Table on Languages and Linguistics (GURT 2007) will focus on little words, I will give a plenary talk on "If the Biggest Little Word”. The abstract deadline for contributed papers and posters is November 10, 2006.

FILED IN SEMANTICS NEWS | COMMENTS (0) | PERMALINK

21st Century Horn
Friday, October 20, 2006

Larry Horn has posted some new papers under the rubric “Selected 21st Century Publications”, including the following two:

- Laurence R. Horn. 2006. "Toward a Freegan"
Now expanded and updated, The Johns Hopkins Online Guide to Literary Theory and Criticism is an indispensable resource for scholars and students of literary theory and discourse. Revised extensively to reflect a decade of rapidly changing scholarship, the Online Guide features 48 new entries and subentries. Compiled by 275 specialists from around the world, the Online Guide presents a comprehensive historical survey of the field’s most important figures, schools, and movements. It includes more than 240 alphabetically arranged entries on critics and theorists, critical schools and movements, and the critical and theoretical innovations of specific countries and historical periods.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABOUT THE GUIDE

SEARCH THE GUIDE:

PREFACE

FOREWORD

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

COPYRIGHT
Specialized Uses of Print-on-Demand

Distributed printing project of Internet Archive

Providing Books At Your Doorsteps

Education For All
A divergence: Dictionaries and Encyclopedias
Online encyclopedias have almost completely supplanted print...
But print dictionaries still sell at near pre-electronic levels
Affordances of the online encyclopedia

Online form facilitates

- instant updating
- easy search
- linking to other articles & sites
- animations, multimedia, etc.

But also transforms economic & publishing model
Features of the print encyclopedia
Affordances of Online Dictionaries

Facilitates search, interaction with other applications, dynamic definition, corpus interaction, etc.
Affordances of the Print Dictionary

Print dictionary doesn't require constant updating

Links aren't crucial

Print dictionary still has symbolic function

Best predictor of dict. purchase: presence of children in house
The Material Presence of the Dictionary: The Thud Factor
At length, what many had wished, and many had attempted in vain, what seemed indeed to demand the united efforts of a number, the diligence and acuteness of a single man performed. The English Dictionary appeared; and, as the weight of truth and reason is irresistible, its authority has nearly fixed the external form of our language; and from its decisions few appeals have yet been made. Robert Nares, 1782
The persistence of form

The dictionary: the most conservative and conventionalized of literary genres.

Cf Adam Makkai: "Nothing significantly new has happened in lexicography since the first printed dictionaries after Gutenberg invented the printing of books."
"The dictionary" like "the Periodic Table": Form answers to structure of represented domain + user needs...

C. Barnhart: "it is the function of a popular dictionary to answer the questions that the user of the dictionary asks."
Features of Johnson's Dictionary

Modularity of Knowledge:
Tries to distinguish lexical from encyclopedic information (though not always successfully)

**shrewmouse** A mouse of which the bite is generally supposed venomous, and to which vulgar tradition assigns such malignity, that she is said to lame the foot over which she runs. I am informed that these reports are calumnious, and that her feet and teeth are equally harmless with those of any other little mouse. Our ancestors however looked on her with such terour, that they are supposed to have given her name to a scolding woman, whom for her venom they call a shrew.

**oats** a grain which in England is generally given to horses, but in Scotland supports the people

**lexicographer** a writer of dictionaries, a harmless drudge...

Omits proper names
The Didactic Uselessness of Definitions

J. provides definitions in genus-differentia format, generally substitutable for definiens (word defined).

Information that D. provides isn't exceptionally accessible or comprehensible.

Cf Miller & Gildea: "The cook stimulated the soup."

Dicts are good on names of concrete categories (marquis, marionette)

But def's of abstract terms are didactically useless:

- **circumstance** (MW10) 1. a condition, fact, or event accompanying, conditioning, or determining another: an essential or inevitable concomitant.

- **structure** (OED) 2. The mutual relation of the constituent parts or elements of a whole as determining its peculiar nature or character.
The Didactic Uselessness of Definitions

Weakness of genus-differential definitions

**disappointment**: the state or emotion of being disappointed
**disappointed** *MW*: defeated in expectation or hope
The Didactic Uselessness of Definitions

Weakness of genus-differentia definitions

**disappointed** MW: defeated in expectation or hope

**disappointment** is when you expect something to happen
The Didactic Uselessness of Definitions

Weakness of genus-differentia definitions

**disappointed** *MW*: defeated in expectation or hope

**disappointment** is when you expect something to happen
And you want it to happen
The Didactic Uselessness of Definitions

Weakness of genus-differentia definitions

**Disappointed** *MW*: defeated in expectation or hope

**disappointment** is when you expect something to happen
And you want it to happen
And when the time comes for it to happen
The Didactic Uselessness of Definitions

Weakness of genus-differentia definitions

**disappointed** *MW*: defeated in expectation or hope

**disappointment** is when you expect something to happen
And you want it to happen
And when the time comes for it to happen
It doesn’t happen
The Didactic Uselessness of Definitions

Weakness of genus-differentia definitions

**Disappointed** *MW*: defeated in expectation or hope

**disappointment** is when you expect something to happen
And you want it to happen
And when the time comes for it to happen
It doesn’t happen
And you feel bad
Responses to Deficiencies

— "We need more public instruction in 'dictionary skills'"
The dictionary and the rise of the public sphere

"A nation of readers" -- the Book Written by Books

"[Johnson's] Dictionary was a typical achievement of print, a language book made out of still other books that would determine the language of books still to be written." Alvin Kernan

How can an autonomous and anonymous public discourse regulate and reproduce itself?

Need to interpret language in absence of knowledge of context, speaker, etc.

Need for a methodology to determine, regulate, and stabilize meanings.

Need for a test to tell which words are "in" the language -- acceptable to use. (which discourses need to be attended to)
The Methodology of Lexicography

Method for isolation & circumscription of relevant precedents (identification of “the language” in terms of public discourse)

Method for isolating and abstracting contributions of individual words to interpretation, independent of both linguistic and extralinguistic contexts

Method of reducing use of word to a "mechanical" rule that determines correct application of word.
The Methodology of Lexicography

Note that application of lexicographical argument isn't limited to use of Dictionary... method is most important for cases where Dict's actual authority is limited -- cf discussions of obscene, terrorism, torture, etc.
The Use of the Dictionary
Defining "The Language"

Why include 'all the words'? Why bother to define simple words?

Cf defs in Nathan Bailey's dict., 1721:

- **cat**: "a creature well known"
- **black**: "a colour"
- **strawberry**: "a well known fruit"
Defining the Compass of the Language

Let any man of correct taste cast his eye on such words as *denominable, opionatry, ariolation, assation, clancular, and comminuible*, and let him say whether a dictionary which gives *thousands* of such items, as *authorized English words*, is a safe standard of writing. Noah Webster on Johnson's Dictionary

Words have been admitted in the language that are not only disreputable in origin, not only offensive in all their associations, not only vulgar in essence, but unfit at all points for survival. The *New York Herald* (1890) on Funk & Wagnall's inclusion of *chesty "bold"

"...that most monstrous of non-words." *Life Magazine* on Webster's *Third International's* inclusion of *irregardless*
Knowledge and the emergence of the "trésor"

Libraries, anthologies, dictionaries, in a word "treasuries" [trésors], alongside of encyclopedic collections, delimit a vast territory on which are cast the signs required for knowledge, the expression of identities, and communication among the members of the group.

-Alain Rey, "Les trésors de la langue," 1986
Canonicity permits "essentialist" abridgement:

"[M]en of good will have extracted the substance of a thousand volumes and passed it in its entirety into a single small duodecimo, a bit like skillful chemists who press out the essence of flowers to concentrate it in a phial while throwing the dregs away."  L.-S.Mercier, *L’An 2440*, 1771

Cf sense of "library" and "bibliothèque" to denote comprehensive publication series & catalogues

"If the lexicon of a language is indeed something like that of a circle, then... if one moves away from the center in concentric circles, the result should be a faithful image of the total lexicon." Henri Béjoint, *Tradition and Innovation in English Dictionaries*, 1992

i.e., In theory, every large dictionary contains every small dictionary
Spatialization and the Forms of Print Discourse

Spatialization of discourse rests on the modes of print circulation

Topology presumes the distinction between public and private

Metricality presumes a correlation between spatiotemporal accessibility/diffusion & reputation...

Cf George Campbell, 1776: “The authors of reputation [provide us with a] certain, steady, and well-known standard to recur to, a standard which every one hath access to canvass and examine.”

...and between reputation and quality:

Cf Hume, Campbell: "reputation and merit go generally together."

Cf also citation indexes...
Symbolism of the dictionary's form

A monument, like a folio dictionary, is immovable and huge, inviolable and absolute in its expression of authority and its solidification of public memory; it exercises its authority as it represents it." (A. Reddick)

There is in [Johnson's Dictionary] a kind of architectural nobleness; it stands there like a great solid square-built edifice; you judge that a true builder did it." (Thos. Carlyle)
The Dict. as an "Inscription in Space": "Is X a word?"

(Note also the importance of visible compression...)
The Form of Collections, 1

Library of the Escorial, 1543

E-L. Boulée, plan for the Bibliothèque du Roi, 1785

Labrouste, Bibliothèque Ste. Geneviève, 1851
The Form of Collections, 2: The classical version

Smirke, British Museum Reading Room, 1851

Labrouste, Bibliothèque Nationale 1868

Pelz/Casey Reading Room, LOC, ca 1898

Asplund, Stockholm City Library, 1928
Circumscription of Knowledge: Brutalist Interpretations

D. Perrault, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, 1994
The Dictionary Online: Where does it End?
The Circumscription Of "The Language" in Metrical Space

The impression of objectivity (Murray's "nebulous masses"). Association of reputation, breadth of diffusion (in time and space), and accessibility, and phenomenal prominence.

It is of importance to have some certain, steady, and well-known standard to recur to, a standard which every one hath access to canvass and examine. And this can be no other than authors of reputation. I choose to name them authors of reputation, rather than good authors, for two reasons: first, because it is more strictly conformable to the truth of the case. It is solely the esteem of the public, and not their intrinsic merit (though these two go generally together), which raises them to this distinction, and stamps a value on their language. Second, this character is more definitive than the other, and therefore more extensively intelligible. Between two or more authors, different readers will differ exceedingly, as to the preference in point of merit, who agree perfectly as to the respective places they hold in the favour of the public.

(Campbell, Phil. Of Rhetoric)

Books as inscriptions in geographic space
"The file written by files"?

Assume (exclusively) electronic discourse. Problems of localization, assurance of common experience...Diffusion/accessibility no indicator of reputation

Difficulties in circumscribing the common public language; individuating subdiscourses; the deceptiveness of frequency
Shadow of the Colossus is a refreshingly simplistic adventure game that is well worth your time. His style is refreshingly simplistic and philosophical.
Shadow of the Colossus is a refreshingly simplistic adventure game that is well worth your time.

His style is refreshingly simplistic and philosophical.
Dictionaries can offer multiple modes of representation

**tango** (MW 10): a ballroom dance of Latin-American origin in 2/4 time with a basic pattern of step-step-step-step-close and characterized by long pauses and stylized body positions
punch 1, vb.
1a: PROD, POKE
1b: DRIVE, HERD <punching cattle>
2a: to strike with a forward thrust esp. of the fist
2b: to drive or push forcibly by or as if by a punch
2c: to hit (a ball) with less than a full swing
3: to emboss, cut, perforate, or make with or as if with a punch
4a: to push down so as to produce a desired result <punch buttons on a jukebox>
4b: to hit or press down the operating mechanism of <punch a time clock> <punch a typewriter>
4c: to produce by or as if by punching keys <punch out a tune on the piano> <a teletypewriter punching out the news>
4d: to enter (as data) by punching keys
5: to give emphasis to

~punch 2n
1: the action of punching
2: a quick blow with or as if with the fist
3: effective energy or forcefulness <a story that packs a punch> <political punch>

punch 3n
1a: a tool usu. in the form of a short rod of steel that is variously shaped at one end for different operations (as forming, perforating, embossing, or cutting)
1b: a short tapering steel rod for driving the heads of nails below a surface
1c: a steel die faced with a letter in relief that is forced into a softer metal to form an intaglio matrix from which foundry type is cast
1d: a device or machine for cutting holes or notches (as in paper or cardboard)
2: a hole or notch from a perforating operation
Alternatives: FrameNet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. frames</th>
<th>lemma</th>
<th>pos/ disp.</th>
<th>COD/FN def</th>
<th>WordNet</th>
<th>Manual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Risk</td>
<td>action</td>
<td>risk</td>
<td>V with FE</td>
<td>COD: act in such a way as to incur the risk of risk help</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ALL FE KDG valence Supp Gov Supp+-c Prep- | Gov+[-c Prep-] trans N untrans N

Num sort = FE; risk.
18 Agent + risk V + Action
01 risk V + Action
19

18. **[Top]**: Agent + risk V + Action

[back to the main table]

1. **1048782**: [<Agent> Nutty] risked Tgt [<Action> looking at him]. **[Top]**
2. **1048785**: [<Agent> HE] risked Tgt [<Action> a quick look at her furious face]. **[Top]**
3. **1048790**: The street ahead was clear so [<Agent> ] slowed and risked Tgt [<Action> a look in the mirror]. **[Top]**
4. **1048793**: [<Agent> HE] ca n't try anything, could n't risk Tgt [<Action> trying to get away]. **[Top]**
5. **1048794**: They were on the choppy, wavelike hills before Milford, a narrow road with too much Friday evening traffic heading south, against them, for [<Agent> Maxum] to risk Tgt [<Action> trying to overtake an
Locolex, f-s technology for treatment of collocations in bilingual dictionaries:

- *il va tenir le coup* -- he’ll hold up
- *gare routière* -- bus station

Cf application to sense-tagging...

Through self-observation, the successfully analyzed patient picks up the inner signals of stress...

5a: to catch sight of: PERCEIVE <pick up the harbor lights>
5b: to come to and follow <picked up the outlaw's trail>
5c: to bring within range of sight or hearing <pick up distant radio signals>
5d: UNDERSTAND, CATCH <didn't pick up the hint>
Can There be "Dictionaries" for online language?

How do we circumscribe "the language" of online discourse?

Disappearance of the distinction between public and private. Where does "English" end?
Can the dictionary retain its symbolic function online?